

## II

### Arab Christians in the Western Mediterranean

(XIth - XIIIth Centuries)

by

HENRI BRESCE

University of Paris X - Nanterre

The Latin Reconquest of the Western Mediterranean from the end of the tenth to the beginning of the thirteenth century isolated and hemmed in several religious and linguistic groups that contribute to the distinctive nature of the societies of the kingdoms that emerged out of this great military enterprise, from Portugal to Sicily. Researchers have focused their attention mainly on the Jewish and Muslim communities, with their outstanding economic, fiscal, and cultural roles, and neglected the Arabized Christian minority under the power of the Muslims, nowadays still victims of suspicion. Only the Christians of Andalusia, Toledo, and ancient Lusitania have been clearly identified as Arabic. Light was shed on their ancient migrations towards the Christian countries of the North of the peninsula, but in Sharq al-Andalus, the East, their very presence was questioned, because for a long time they were mistakenly confused with other groups speaking Romance languages, while toponomy suggests their continued survival. In Africa, research about Christian groups generally ended inconclusively, while such groups in Sicily have been confused with the Greeks of Valdemone, the northern region between Cefalù and Taormina, of the same culture and of the same language as those of neighbouring Calabria.

Jacques de Vitry suggested grouping the Christians of Andalus and Africa under the name of Mozarabs<sup>1</sup> – a name which has been for long ambiguous. In Spain it was first used by historians as synonymous with Christians who fell under Muslim domination, without taking into account the extent of linguistic Arabization. Heir to a long tradition, Claudio Sanchez-Albornoz chose to ignore the basic fact of Arabization and described the language of the Mozarabs as *aljamiado* – a Romance language written in Arabic characters. Spanish scholars often employ, generally in an illogical way, the terms ‘Mozarabic dialect’ and ‘Mozarabisms’ to indicate variants of Iberian Romance and linguistic characteristics which show the evolution of Romance languages isolated by the wave of Arabic<sup>2</sup> and which came under its influence, just as spoken Arabic came under their influence. Yet nothing indicates that these languages in Spain, Africa, and perhaps Sicily were used exclusively, or even mostly, by the Christians. In the Iberian peninsula, on the other hand, many are the documents which leave no doubt. And, first of all, the name. We must reject every other etymology (‘Mixti arabes’, according to Archbishop Rodrigo Jimenez de Rada!) except the active participle of the tenth form, conative, built on the root ‘rb (‘Arabic’), *musta‘rib* (that wishes to be Arabic, chooses to be so, tries to be so), confused in the spoken language with a passive

---

<sup>1</sup> *Historia Orientalis*, in J. Bongars, *Gesta Dei per Francos* (Hanover, 1611), 1095: ‘Illi vero christiani qui in Africa et Hispania inter occidentalis Sarracenos commorantur, Mozarabes nuncupati latinam habent litteram et latino sermone in scripturis utuntur.’ Jacques de Vitry, who devotes only a few lines (in contrast with more than a page for the ‘Syrians’), emphasizes their loyalty to the dogmas and practices of the Latin Church.

<sup>2</sup> See the review by A. Cortabarría Beitia, ‘Les Etudes mozarabes en Espagne’, *Mélanges de l’Institut dominicain d’études orientales*, xiv (1980), 5-74. For this interpretation, A.M. Alcover, ‘Los Mozarabes baleares’, *Revista de Archivos*, xxv (1922), 513-37; M. Sanchis Guarner, *Els parlars romanics de Valencia i Mallorca anteriors a la Reconquista* (Valencia, 1961). Same reference in A. Varvaro, *Lingua e società in Sicilia*, i (Palermo, 1981), 157.

participle *musta'rab*. In Toledo the Mozarabs wrote exclusively in Arabic, in an unsophisticated language very close to oral expression.<sup>3</sup> In Sicily, things are more complicated; here documentation, apart from a number of specific documents (notarial acts in Arabic of the twelfth century and lists of inhabitants), is made up of a considerable amount of onomastic evidence, which is obviously subject to controversy.<sup>4</sup> In Africa, where researchers explored simultaneously the traces of Latin Christianity and linguistic<sup>5</sup> Romance elements, the problem regarding the language spoken by the Christians has been raised only by Mohammed Talbi,<sup>6</sup> and it was immediately solved: as in Spain, Latin was limited to the liturgical role, and consequently it remained, up to the eleventh century, the language of epitaphs, whose quality stresses the link with literary models.

#### SOURCES AND HISTORIOGRAPHY

In the Iberian peninsula, the religious writings which accompany the phenomenon of the voluntary martyrdoms and the evidence of the chronicles, Arabic and Latin, of the Reconquest, are supported by a rich harvest of documents concerning the practice concentrated in Toledo of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries.<sup>7</sup> In Africa,

---

<sup>3</sup> J.P. Molénat, 'Notes sur les traducteurs de Tolède', *Cahiers d'Etudes Arabes*, ii (1988), 109-44.

<sup>4</sup> For further details, forthcoming article in *Mélanges, in memory of L.R. Ménager*, in collaboration with A. Nef.

<sup>5</sup> T. Lewicki, 'Une langue romane oubliée de l'Afrique du Nord. Observations d'un arabisant', *Rocznik Orientalistyczny*, xvii (1951-52 [1953]), 415-80; S. Lancel, 'La vie et la survie de la latinité en Afrique du Nord. Etat des questions', *Revue des études latines*, lix (1981), 269-97.

<sup>6</sup> M. Talbi, 'Le christianisme maghrébin de la conquête musulmane à sa disparition', in *Conversion and Continuity. Indigenous Christian Communities in Islamic Lands: Eighth to Eighteenth Centuries*, ed. M. Gerbers and R.J. Bikhari (Toronto, 1990), 313-51.

<sup>7</sup> A. González Palencia, *Los Mozárabes de Toledo en los siglos XII y XIII*, 4 vols. (Madrid, 1926-30).

besides the sepulchral inscriptions of Kairouan,<sup>8</sup> Ain Zara, and En Ngila,<sup>9</sup> there are scattered notices which come from the writings of the *Tabaḳāt* and the *fatwas* of the *ulamâ*,<sup>10</sup> eager to avoid religious<sup>11</sup> contamination and to impose the *tamyîz*, the wearing of

<sup>8</sup> For the interpretations of Saumagne and Seston, Ch. Courtois, 'Grégoire VII et l'Afrique du Nord. Remarques sur les communautés chrétiennes d'Afrique au XIe siècle', *Revue historique*, 195 (1945), 97-122, 193-226; A. Mahjoubi, 'Nouveau témoignage épigraphique sur la communauté chrétienne de Kairouan au XIe siècle', *Africa*, i (1966), 85-96; N. Duval, 'Les nouveautés de l'archéologie tunisienne. Une inscription médiévale de Kairouan: histoire d'une interprétation discutée', *Revue des Etudes Augustiniennes*, 37 (1991), 144-50. To recapitulate, the Greek Alloupha, buried at an unknown date; an unknown person who died in 1007/397 AH, 5th indiction; Firmus, son of Sisinius, *lector*, who died in 1019 (not in 1030), 2nd indiction (with a mistake of one year, according to Mahjoubi); Petrus *senior* (or perhaps the *presbyter* Solomon, *senior*) who died in [1038]/438 AH, 14th indiction. The particular meaning of *senior* in the African Church (a layman entrusted with the supervision of the ecclesiastical patrimony) almost definitely rules out the correction '*presbiter* Solomon'.

<sup>9</sup> The first necropole was made known to the public by S. Aurigemma, *L'"area" cimiteriale cristiana di 'Ain Zâra presso Tripoli di Barberia* (Rome, 1932). It has been re-dated to the end of the tenth and the beginning of the eleventh century by A. Di Vita, 'La diffusione del cristianesimo nell'interno della Tripolitania attraverso in monumenti e sue sopravvivenze nella Tripolitania araba', *Quaderni di archeologia della Libia*, v (1967), 121-42, 134. The latter also points out some tombs at Sabratha and in a church at Leptis used in the eleventh century. There are 121 tombs; in the second, 29 near an inhabited centre and a small church (11 tombs with epitaphs made public by Paribeni, together with 18 new tombs excavated in 1971): R. Bartoccini and D. Mazzoleni, 'Le iscrizioni del cimiterio di En Ngila', *Rivista di Archeologia cristiana* (1977), 157-98.

<sup>10</sup> H.R. Idris, 'Les Tributaires en Occident musulman médiéval d'après le *Miy'âr* d'al-Wansharîsî', *Mélanges d'Islamologie à la mémoire d'A. Abel* (Leyden, 1974), 172-96; in particular, the obligation to wear the *zunnâr* recalled by the *qâdî* of Kairouan, Ibn Abî Tâlib, before 888.

<sup>11</sup> Around the year 1000, al-Qâbisî was worried that the Muslims were participating in Christian feasts. Id., 'Fêtes chrétiennes célébrées en Ifriqiyya à l'époque ziride', *Revue africaine*, 98 (1954), 261-76: Christmas, Easter, St John's, the Epiphany, and 'Anabdas, which Idris identifies with

distinctive clothes, in conformity with the edict of Mutawakkil. These notices make up for the scarcity of information in the chronicles. In Sicily, Greek hagiographical accounts suggest a reality which was confirmed, a long time after the conquest, by lists of serfs and notarial acts of the twelfth and the first decades of the thirteenth centuries. Everywhere, Arabic poetry evoked a Christian presence which was a vector for transgression and eroticism.<sup>12</sup>

This corpus of source material describes situations historically close and also evolving, an evolution carried to a final point in Africa: the survival of rarefied ecclesiastical structures and of reduced communities, the linguistic Arabization. Interest in them is largely determined by ideological considerations. Thus, in Spain, they have greatly contributed to a rich historiography, yet extremely careful not to break the 'rock-like' continuity of the faith and the Spanish race by recalling the Mozarabs' place in the Visigothic cultural heritage. Research slows down, therefore, in the works of Simonet and Las Cagigas,<sup>13</sup> at the end of the episode of the Córdoba martyrs, and stops at the Reconquest, after which the Mozarab phenomenon is no longer legitimate. On the other hand, a quite recent regional history has been trying to find, in the presence of the Mozarabs, an important guarantee of the specific nature of Valencia.<sup>14</sup> A rigorous Islamic historiography, on the contrary, rejects these 'evanescent' Mozarabs.

the *Qalandās* of Antioch (philology can lead you anywhere !). From this he goes on to postulate a renewal of the African Church by Fatimid Alexandria, without any further evidence.

<sup>12</sup> H. Pérès, *La Poésie andalouse en arabe classique au XI<sup>e</sup> siècle. Ses aspects généraux et sa valeur documentaire* (Paris, 1938), 227 (wine and illicit love). In Ifriqiyya, the poet 'Abd al-Rahmān b. Muhammad al-Azdi, called al-Mithqāl, also writes of his love for a young Christian wine seller: Idris, 'Fêtes', 271.

<sup>13</sup> F.J. Simonet, *História de los Mozárabes de España* (Madrid, 1903); I. de las Cagigas, *Minorías étnico-religiosas de la Edad Media Española, i: Los Mozárabes* (Madrid, 1947).

<sup>14</sup> For example, L. Peñarroja Torrejón, *El Mozárabe de Valencia. Nuevas cuestiones de fonología mozárabe* (Madrid, 1990), 446. The author distinguishes, however, between religious Mozarabism and usage of a

There were other considerations – those of recovering the Latin, Roman, and Christian continuity beyond Islam and of justifying the missionary work of the end of the nineteenth century. These considerations contributed greatly to colonial French historiography about Christian Africa. A feeling of failure, in the face of the intransigence of Islam, leaves its mark on the interpretation of the disappearance of Christianity in North Africa. Some wanted to interpret this disappearance as the outcome of the Almohad policy to eradicate religious minorities. Yet the survival of Judaism weakens this theory. Finally, we notice the absence, in the research concerning Sicily, of any acknowledgement of their existence. Taking as a point of departure the concept of generalized co-occurrence of language, ethnicity, and religion, Michele Amari interpreted the Christian names of the platee of the Arabic serfs as those of converts.<sup>15</sup> And yet their study may enable us to answer many of the questions which crop up about all these Arabic Christian communities.

I will thus endeavour to synthesize in turn the times, the effects of Arabization, the distinctive characteristics of Arabic Christianity, and finally, the effects of the conquest by the Latin kingdoms on Mozarabic communities. I will attempt this through a comparison of three particular areas, in Europe and in Africa. It will entail the application of some elements of synthesis to the great question concerning the identity of the Arabic Christians and of their social and political role in the Dâr al-Islâm, the House of Islam, in the West, then in the kingdoms of the Latin Reconquest. Were they 'evanescent' groups, caught between a double scorn – that of the Muslims towards the *dhimmis*, and that of Latin Christians towards collaborators with the Islamic power,

---

Romance dialect. See the overall critique in P. Guichard, 'Les Mozarabes de Valence et d'al-Andalus entre l'histoire et le mythe', *Revue de l'Occident Musulman et de la Méditerranée*, 40 (1985), 17-27; and, in particular, his analysis of the extraordinary assemblage made by J. Girones García, *Los Mozárabes valencianos. Xàtiva mozàrabe. Estudio documentado basado en la arqueología* (Valencia, 1983), based on falsehood.

<sup>15</sup>

Taken up again by Varvaro, *Lingua e società*, 112.

deprived by Arabization of any lasting identity and threatened by Islamization? Or were they, on the contrary, the proud heirs of a dual tradition – that of the Roman Empire and that of Arabic culture fully assumed?

## LANGUAGE AND RITE

### 1 *The Period of Arabization*

In the first decades of the ninth century, the Aghlabid conquest aligned Sicily on the model of Africa and the Iberian peninsula. Two Latin churches and one Greek were from now on subjected to the *dhimma*, and there was a spontaneous pressure on the faithful and the higher staff which encouraged linguistic Arabization, the cultural crossing of habits and factors that could lead to religious Islamization. Regarded as a danger by the future ‘martyrs of Córdoba’, the process of Arabization followed three courses.

The Mozarabs of the Iberian peninsula were in the first place clearly distinguished. They were distinguished primarily by their Arab language, and the name itself which they applied to themselves identified them as Arabized.<sup>16</sup> D. Urvoy<sup>17</sup> studied the ‘symbolic aspects’ of their name which was particular to them; indeed, the Muslims called them *a’djam*, ‘foreigners’, here ‘Latins’.<sup>18</sup>

The fact that *musta’rib* is found first in León has led to the far-fetched hypothesis that there was a weak Christianization in Spain at the time of the conquest, the name of ‘Arabized’ being applied – not without a pejorative connotation – only to those migrants driven northwards<sup>19</sup> by career ambitions. This supposed

---

<sup>16</sup> In Toledo, it is from the *fuero* of 1101 onwards that they are called *Mozarabs*.

<sup>17</sup> ‘Les aspects symboliques du vocable “mozarabe”. Essai de réinterprétation’, *Studia Islamica*, 78 (1993), 117-54.

<sup>18</sup> ‘*Adjam* is exclusively referring to the language of worship, since the supposed ‘Mozarabic dialect’, of which linguists find some traces, is simply the *Romance* of the south of Spain and the Levant.

<sup>19</sup> R. Hitchcock, ‘Quienes fueron los verdaderos Mozárabes?’, *Nueva Revista*



connotation has led M. de Epalza to choose a partisan translation: 'one that seems Arab, that presents the appearance of an Arab, *without being so*'.<sup>20</sup> But for Francisco Javier Hernández,<sup>21</sup> the use of Arabic, carried on after the Reconquest, would become, on the contrary, a means of proudly affirming the continuity of the Mozarabs with Visigothic antiquity.

The attachment to the Arabic language and to its use was quite basic. It was the very rapid Arabization of the Christians of Córdoba that led to the crisis of 850-59 and to the outbreak of the voluntary martyrdoms.<sup>22</sup> An indication of this was the use of Arab names from 812 onwards by the *Spani* living in Septimania,<sup>23</sup> by at least one of the Mozarabs in the Court of Córdoba during the crisis of the voluntary martyrdoms (Leovigild, also called *Abad-solomes*, 'Abd al-Salam),<sup>24</sup> and by the immigrants who crowded into León in the ninth and tenth centuries.<sup>25</sup> Besides a fairly wide

*de Filología*, xxx (1981), 574-85. For him the real Christians, *nasâra*, carry Latin names; Arabic names indicate 'inactive Christians', for whom the Church is there to provide a joy or career. In general, same connotations in P. Chalmeta, *Mozarabes*, in *Encyclopédie Islamique*, 2nd edn.

<sup>20</sup> M. de Epalza, 'Les Mozarabes. Etat de la question', *Revue du Monde Musulman et de la Méditerranée*, 63-4 (1992): special issue, *Minorités religieuses en Espagne médiévale*, 39-51. This special number is marked by a vigorous attempt at a historiographic re-evaluation of the *Arcadia felix* of the three religions and the two cultures, tolerance, harmony, and multiculturalism. This is quite healthy, but it can be easily exaggerated in the extreme.

<sup>21</sup> 'Language and Cultural Identity: the Mozarabs of Toledo', paper read at the conference *Le pluralisme linguistique dans la société médiévale*, Montreal, May 1986.

<sup>22</sup> E. Colbert, *The Martyrs of Cordoba (850-859): A Study of the Sources* (Washington, 1962); Dominique Millet-Gérard, *Chrétiens mozarabes et culture islamique dans l'Espagne des VIIIe-IXe siècles* (Paris, 1984).

<sup>23</sup> Zoleiman; E. Cauvet, *Etude sur l'établissement des Espagnols dans la Septimanie aux VIIIe et IXe siècles* (Montpellier, 1898), 98.

<sup>24</sup> Colbert, *Martyrs*, 413.

<sup>25</sup> E. Diaz Jiménez, 'Immigración mozárabe en el reino de León', *Boletín de*



range of anthroponyms,<sup>26</sup> they also took up the use of *Kunya*, the honourable tecronym.<sup>27</sup> It should be observed that this Arab name could be different from the baptismal name<sup>28</sup> and that, in the case of married couples, it was the male who had an Arabic anthroponym, while the woman assumed a Romance name.<sup>29</sup> This deep Arabization made the Spanish Mozarabs use bilingual texts.<sup>30</sup> It also led to the compilation of Latino-Arabic glossaries in order to afford easy access to texts in Latin<sup>31</sup> and to translate into Arabic the Gospels (946, Ishâq b. Velazco), selections of Canonic collections (1050, by the priest Vincent for Bishop 'Abd al-Malik), as well as the history of Orose.<sup>32</sup>

The survival of Christian nuclei and their Arabization in Africa are quite early attested to. Thus, we find the greeting paid to the

*la Real Academia de la Historia*, xx (1892), 123-51.

<sup>26</sup> 'Abdallâh, 'Abd al-Malik, Ayyûb, Dâ'ûd, Habîb, Hilal, 'Isâ, Malik, Mansûr, Marwân, Mûsâ, Sulayman, 'Umar, Yahyâ.

<sup>27</sup> Abû Ayyûb, Abû Ghâlib, Abû 'Isâ, Abû 'Umar, Abû Yahyâ.

<sup>28</sup> Hitchcock, 'Quienes fueron', cites double names (Hilal called Salvatus, Theodimir called Musa, Habba called Leocadia); but here it concerns ecclesiastics, particularly abbots, who could have received a new name on taking Holy Orders.

<sup>29</sup> Glick, *Islamic and Christian Spain*, 177, in the charters of the monastery of Ardón (947-989).

<sup>30</sup> For example, the text of Sigüenza of the beginning of the tenth century; D. de Bruyne and E. Tisserant, 'Une feuille arabo-latine de l'Épître aux Galates', *Revue Biblique*, n.s., 7 (1910), 322-43.

<sup>31</sup> Glossary of Leyden, dated Monday, 26 July by a chronogram (the date tallies perfectly, but one is rather surprised by the use of the Roman era by a Toledan Mozarab) by Van Koningsfeld, *The Latin-Arabic Glossary of the Leyden University* (Leyden, 1971), 39.

<sup>32</sup> M.Th. Urvoy, 'La culture et la littérature arabe des chrétiens d'al-Andalus', *Bulletin de Littérature ecclésiastique*, xcii, 4 (1991), 259-75, regards these translations and the adaptation of the psalms in Arabic by Hafs b. Alvaro in the ninth century as the swan-song of the Mozarabic Christianities.

Governor at Kairouan in 793 by the Christian Qustâs, who proclaimed a passage from the Koran and obtained in recompense the construction of a church.<sup>33</sup> The chronicle of Ibn Saghîr similarly developed the theme of the political and military alliance between the Ibadites of Tahert and one sub-group of *A'djam*, who were here clearly identified as Christians, *masîyun*, and commanded by notables like Ibn Warda.<sup>34</sup> These accounts clearly show the familiarity of the Christians with the Arab language and culture. The *A'djam* of Tahert took part in the fighting on the side of Rostemid Imam, and particularly Bahr b. al-Wâhid, an outstanding knight, and Djân (John) killed by the rebels of Tahert. Again in 1234 a letter from a missionary to Raymond of Pennafort indicates the presence in Tunis of 'Arami', that is, Christians and 'slaves of the Saracens', who understood no language other than Arabic.<sup>35</sup> Yet the names on epitaphs in Kairouan and in Tripolitania, carefully sifted by ecclesiastical culture, only allow a very weak trace of cultural crossing.<sup>36</sup>

The Arabization of at least a section of the Christians in Sicily is shown only by late sources: some Arabic documents of Norman times and the more uncertain evidence provided by the corpus of names.<sup>37</sup> In Sicily we find no generic group name like the Iberian

---

<sup>33</sup> R. Marston Speight, 'Témoignages des sources musulmanes sur la présence chrétienne au Maghreb de 26-747 à 184-800', *Ibla*, 35 (1972), 73-96.

<sup>34</sup> T. Lewicki, 'Une commune chrétienne dans l'oasis de Ouargla au e siècle', *Etudes maghrébines et soudanaises*, i (Warsaw, 1976), 79-90; R. Marston Speight, 'The Place of the Christians in Ninth-Century North Africa', *Islamochristiana*, 4 (1978), 47-65. Source: Ibn Saghîr, 'Chronique sur les imams rostémides de Tahert', ed. A. de C. Motylinski, in *Actes du XIVe Congrès international des Orientalistes*, v (Paris, 1908), 3-132, 98-100.

<sup>35</sup> R. Mesnage, *Le Christianisme en Afrique. Eglise mozarabe, esclaves chrétiens* (Paris-Algiers, 1915), 67.

<sup>36</sup> One personal name only, possibly *Alloupha*.

<sup>37</sup> The study of this has been facilitated by the admirable work of identification undertaken by G. Caracausi, *Lessico greco della Sicilia e dell'Italia meridionale (secoli X-XIV)* (Palermo, 1990).

'Mozarab', and the only useful indication comes from the use of a name or surname in Arabic. Yet we do have the isolated case of a Greek monk in Messina who, in 1192, describes himself as the son of *Nikolaos ho Arabos*.<sup>38</sup> This self-appellation is evidently of primary importance; if one accepts its relationship to the name itself of *musta'rib*, it would sound like a claim of identity.

The notarial acts of Palermo and its suburbs, from 1100, the lists of Catania and Aci, about 1095, of Patti (1131-48), and of Corleone in 1178, present, as far as the Christians are concerned, an abundant use of Arabic names. Basically, this practice is neutral, without any significant religious connotation;<sup>39</sup> yet mixed with Christian forenames,<sup>40</sup> it becomes difficult to distinguish it from names of Greek and, soon afterwards, of Latin origin.<sup>41</sup> As in the case of Spain, we find traces of the double name: in 1202, Gilbert was also called *Mahalufus* (Makhlûf). In a deeply Hellenized environment, at Naso and in the villages of Patti, Arabic names were rare, while surnames were stereotyped on the model of *Filadelfos Cafiris*, Philadelphos 'the Infidel', or *Anastasis Changemis* 'the Barber'. All in all, women's personal names, though less numerous, were more Arabized than those of men,<sup>42</sup> and we find a nucleus of

<sup>38</sup> A. Amico, *I Diplomi della Cattedrale di Messina* (Palermo, 1888), 421.

<sup>39</sup> Some specifically Muslim names, Ahmad, Alî, Muhammad (two in Corleone, which can be compared to the Maltese name coming from Muhammad), Hammûd, and numerous names common to Islam and Christianity: Amr, Djafar, Fityân, Khâlid, Khilfa, Maymûn, Mukhlûf, Mawlâ (*Mules*), Nama, Radwân, Salmûn, Samîûn, Sâûd, Sulaymân, Umar (*Omuris*), Uqba, Uthmân (*Osmanos*), Yûsuf; and theophores: Abdallâh, Abd al-Aziz, Abd al-Malik, Abd al-Mawlâ, Abd al-Rahmân; and kunyas: Abû'l-Fadl, Abu'l-Faradj, Abû'l-Futûh, Abû Ghâlib, Abû'l-Khayr, Abû Sâid, Abû'l-Tayb (Eugenius); one should note the characteristically Maghrebian augmentatives in *-ûn*.

<sup>40</sup> Andriya, Bâtrû, Branqât (Pancratios), Djûân, Filîp, Ilyâs, Isâ, Liûn, Nikûla, Quzmân (Kosmas), Thûdur (Theodôros), Yuhannâ, Yannâdj (Gennakos).

<sup>41</sup> Duminîq b. Abdallâh in 1170.

<sup>42</sup> On the one hand, Azuzes, Charufa, Charusa, Chusin and Chusun, Indulcia, Kasar, Haouene, Mamouna, Sadona, Sahiliba, Sêtelhousan, Sictidar, Sitelkioul, and Sittilcul, Sitennês, and Christodoulê, Constanza,

stereotyped feminine names in Arabic up to 1250 (*Charufa*, *Charusa*).

The major problem is the extent of Arabization of those among the Greeks of Valdemone and nearby Calabria who have an Arabic name or surname; a surname denoting function or job<sup>43</sup> suggests an isolated loan. This might also be the case for certain stereotyped elements which served to build very evocative surnames: *Hâdj* ('pilgrim'), *Qâsir* ('short'), used alone or in conjunction with a name, following a model typical in Greek. We continue to encounter surnames in *Qâsir* in Calabria up to the fourteenth century, when Arabic had virtually been forgotten. Forenames, once again masculine, like *Dja'far* (*Tzaphpharis*), *Maymûn*, *Mawlâ* (*Moule*), *Salîm* (*Selimos*), or feminine like *Husun* and lineage names like *Hammûd* (*Hamoutos*) show at least a lasting familiarity with the Arab tongue and most probably proclaim a noteworthy lineage. A *Kunya* indicates a deeper familiarity with Arabic structures of name and kinship,<sup>44</sup> while the use of topographical *nisba* was reserved for immigrants from Africa or Spain (that the Christians in the West received the names of tribes is definitely untenable).

## 2 A Multifarious Rite

Mozarabic identity in the Iberian peninsula, however, was inconceivable save within membership of a Church defined by the Latin Visigothic rite, which guaranteed the solidarity and permanence of the group. Jean-Pierre Molénat has brought to light the conflicts after 1150 between the Latin clergy and the 'new Mozarabs' who crowded into Toledo from the Almohad territories and settled within Latin parishes. While victorious Castile had abandoned Visigothic liturgy, Mozarabic distinctiveness was focused mostly on the rite. The vernacular language doubtlessly found a place in the worship,

---

Margarita, on the other.

<sup>43</sup> *'arif* (lawman), *hadjdjâm* (barber), *harîrî* (silky, weaver), *qass* (priest), or, sometimes, a Greek form different from the Arabic derivative (*hannitès*, for *khân*, innkeeper, *hanouterios*, tavern keeper).

<sup>44</sup> *Busit* (Abû Said), *Boulkeramos* (Abû'l-Karam),

since clerics took the trouble to translate into Arabic the Gospels and the Psalter, but only as language of the people.

The Latinity of the African Church is equally attested to. The hypothesis of a revival of the Church of Ifriqiyya under Alexandrine influence does not seem to rest on any concrete evidence, and the traces of an African Hellenism are very rare: the name of Bishop Pantoleon in the *Life* of Elijah the Younger; some anthroponyms in Tripolitanian cemeteries at 'Ain Zara<sup>45</sup> and En Ngila;<sup>46</sup> and part of an epitaph re-used at Kairouan.<sup>47</sup> Yet the corpus of African epitaphs is written in Latin, like those of Spanish Córdoba, not without traces of dialect after all, but with impressive indications of a sophisticated literary knowledge (a reference to Virgil at 'Ain Zara). It is Church Latin, whose quality indicates the existence of schools of grammar and liturgy.<sup>48</sup>

In Sicily, on the other hand, the Church of the Arabic community appertained to the Byzantine rite. This is evidenced by the presence, admittedly late, in the dome of Martorana (the Greek church of the Admiral George of Antioch) of a painted inscription in Arabic, which resumes the great doxology. As to the Graeco-Arabic manuscripts of Italy, psalters<sup>49</sup> and gospels,<sup>50</sup> they

<sup>45</sup> *Georgios* (tomb 33).

<sup>46</sup> Besides names in Latin and of dubious origin (*Cora, Maria, Carinus, Petrus, Speratus*, ), we also find a *Fokios* and a *Solomonina*.

<sup>47</sup> Its origin – Egyptian, Sicilian, or African – and its date, later or more ancient than that of the Latin inscription at the back, are discussed in Duval, 'Les nouveautés'. The name of the deceased seems to have been *Alloupha*.

<sup>48</sup> As in Spain; see Simonet, *História*, 621, the epitaph of the noble (*Inlustrissimus*) precentor Samuel, who died in 958 near Málaga.

<sup>49</sup> Both might have been Sicilians: the Harleianus 5786, dated 1153, Greek, Latin, and Arabic; and the Vienne, Greek supplement 94, Greek, Latin, and Arabic, of the eleventh century; R. Devreesse, *Les Manuscrits grecs de l'Italie méridionale* (Vatican City, 1955: Studi e Testi, No.183), 40, 54.

<sup>50</sup> Greco-Arabic gospels in the Bibliothèque National, Paris, Greek suppl. 911, dated 1043, possibly written in Lombard Italy; they confirm an Arabic presence (a monastery, or a small community, which might,

show the use of Arabic in the liturgy, but their origin is not altogether incontestable. We do not know either the scribes or the communities that used them. It is finally on the basis of the more recent evidence provided by Ludolf of Sudheim, a traveller of the 1330s, that our main information lies. He attests to the presence in Sicily, most probably in the eastern part which he knew best, of a Church of the Arab rite, obviously a branch of the Greek rite.<sup>51</sup> The precise details of his voyage memoirs are sufficient guarantee to remove any confusion with the East.

Differentiated by the rite, but subjected to the same constraints of an Islamic environment, the Arabic Christianity of the West was first and foremost eager to assert itself vigorously. The controversy with Islam and the militant self-assertion, centred around Córdoba in the ninth century, revived the Visigothic tradition of Julian of Toledo of a struggle against Judaism and the temptation to Judaize.<sup>52</sup> The contact with Islam also reinforced, as in Egypt, an ancient practice easily described as heretical and which went back to the Church of Jerusalem, that of the Apostle James, namely, obeying the prescriptions and bans of the former Law, circumcision, and the rejection of pork,<sup>53</sup> blood, and unclean meat. Thus Ibn Hazm recalls that, at the beginning of the eleventh century, 'the majority of Christians living nowadays among the Muslims are circumcized.'<sup>54</sup> As to the prohibition of blood, it has been as much

---

moreover, be of Oriental, Syrian, or Anatolian origin).

<sup>51</sup> Ludolph de Suchem, *De Itinere Terræ Sanctæ*, ed. F. Deycks (Stuttgart, 1851), 20: 'Tamen in Sicilia indifferenter ad tres ritus se habent: in una parte ad ritum latinum, in alia ad ritum Græcorum, in tertia ad ritum Sarracenorum; attamen, omnes sunt Christiani, licet ritu differant et discordent'.

<sup>52</sup> The question of the 10 September fast cropped up even in the eighth century; Colbert, *Martyrs*, 52.

<sup>53</sup> Jean de Gorze testified in 959 that the Christians in Spain did not eat pork – quoted in Dufourcq, *La coexistence*, 218.

<sup>54</sup> M. Asín Palacios, *Abenhamz de Cordoba y su historia critica de las ideas religiosas*, (Madrid, 1927-32), iii, 109. Those of Seville, however, might have been obliged to practise circumcision by Mutadid, according to the



the subject of controversy as the refusal to eat pagan food, condemned by a Council of Córdoba in the ninth century.<sup>55</sup>

### 3 Relations between Arabic Christian Communities

This diversity of rites does not prohibit the unity among the Western Arabic Christian communities. One can discern fleeting indications of the relations which existed between them. The Muslim conquest itself first contributed to displace compact groups of Christians from East to West. Copts were installed at Tunbûd near Tunis to work in the naval arsenals;<sup>56</sup> others have given their name (*al-Aqbât*) to a village in the immediate vicinity of Palermo. The *Life* of the Sicilian St Elijah the Younger, captive in Africa in 835, shows moreover the enforced displacements between the Christian communities of Sicily and Africa relative to the conquest. It describes an African environment not at all worthy of the hagiographer's esteem. After being sold to a Christian, Elijah was again sold to a tanner, himself a Christian, and, in the manner of Joseph, resisted the temptations of his master's wife, for which he was flogged and then put in chains. In the end, he redeemed himself. Once free, he began assiduously to frequent the churches, probably at Kairouan, and even displayed healing powers, because of which he ended up in prison for converting Muslims. Eventually he departed for Palestine and Sinai.<sup>57</sup> On the contrary, the emigration of Christian Andalusians to Ifriqiyya is nothing more than a hypothesis of P. Mesnage.<sup>58</sup>

---

testimony of Ibn 'Abdun; J. Bosch Vilá, *Historia de Sevilla. La Sevilla Islámica, 712-1248* (Seville, 1988), 351.

<sup>55</sup> D. Urvoy, 'La pensée religieuse des Mozarabes face à l'Islam', *Traditio*, 39 (1983), 419-32.

<sup>56</sup> Abou-Obéid el-Bekri, *Description de l'Afrique septentrionale*, ed. and trans. M.G. de Slane (Algiers, 1911-3), 83-4.

<sup>57</sup> G. Da Costa Louillet, 'Saints de Sicile et d'Italie méridionale aux VIIIe, IXe et Xe siècles', *Byzantion*, xxix-xxx (1959-60), 89-173; G. Rossi Taibi, *Vita di Sant'Elia il Giovane* (Palermo, 1952), 15-23.

<sup>58</sup> This rests only on the proximity of Latin inscriptions on the epitaphs of



Moreover, relations between the focal points of Western Christianity never ceased to exist. At the time of the crisis of the 'voluntary martyrdoms' of Córdoba, it was the eastern itinerant monks who fanned the faith and the spirit of sacrifice, contrary to the decisions of the Andalusian episcopate. George of Bethlehem, put to death in 890, was a monk, alms-collector from the great monastery of Saint-Sabas, close to Jerusalem, who came via Africa. His presence, and that of Servideo, an itinerant monk who received martyrdom in 851, indicate normal, if not frequent, relations with a Palestinian Christianity of Greek culture and sensibility. Other links have been discovered: in the first thirty years of the tenth century, the Coptic doctor Nastas b. Djuraydj dedicated a tract on the subject of urine to his colleague, the Mozarab Khalid b. Rûmân.<sup>59</sup>

Urvoy<sup>60</sup> has provided insight into the Spanish Mozarabs' tenth-century appeal to the Nestorian texts of polemic against Islam, that of 'Abd al-Malik, and the dialogues of Catholicos Timothy the First with the Caliph Mahdî. The relatively late usage of these texts, the only ones available in Arabic which had become the language of culture and communication of Spanish Christians, does not necessarily imply theological links with the Nestorians with whom the Mozarabs are naturally close. At the end of the eighth century, the adoptionist thesis of Elipand, Metropolitan of Toledo, drew the accusations of Nestorianism by the Frankish bishops, but doubtlessly this was merely linked to the vast movement of the Tricapitoline heresy in Germanic Europe.

The arrival on Sicily between 980 and 985 of Orestes, an Egyptian Christian and the future Greek Patriarch of Jerusalem, is well testified.<sup>61</sup> Orestes undertook the compilation of a biography of the

Kairouan and Spain. On this issue, the studies of Vézin promise certain conclusions which I would not like to reveal superficially.

<sup>59</sup> D. Urvoy, 'La pensée'.

<sup>60</sup> Ibid.

<sup>61</sup> M. Scaduto, *Il monachesimo basiliano nella Sicilia medievale. Rinascita e decadenza, sec. XI-XIV* (2nd edn., Rome, 1982), xxxvii.

Sicilian saints Saba, Christopher, and Macair. This visit did not make him leave the Greek community or the Fatimid State, to which the family of Orestes was intimately linked and which at Caliph 'Azîz's time was governed by the Melkite 'Isâ b. Nasturûs. Other less reliable indications point to the relations between the Christians of Sharq al-Andalus and Sicily: the abduction of a saint's body from a miraculous sanctuary near Cartagena, stolen by the Franks in 1023-4 and later transported to Sicily, where the Christians bootlessly offered considerable sums of money to keep the relics;<sup>62</sup> and the veneration of the Sicilians towards the church of the Virgin in the Murcian neighbourhood by the Rashâqa before the Reconquest.<sup>63</sup>

The *Calendar of Córdoba* allows a fairly accurate description of the religious atmosphere of the Mozarabs of al-Andalus in 961. Some of the 109 feasts which it lists belong doubtlessly to a memory which was dead and derived from books which Bishop Recemundo consulted.<sup>64</sup> Yet the geographical partitioning of saints and churches quoted is of great interest. Basically the world of the Mozarabs in Spain was the heritage of the Visigothic Kingdom and the Church: at least 34 saints and 19 cities in the Iberian peninsula (up to León and Barcelona in the North), and three of the provinces which belonged to Toulouse (Baudile of Nîmes, Genès of Arles, Sernin of Toulouse). The East is that of the Christian origins (Antioch, Bethlehem, Jerusalem, Cesarea of Palestine), that of the life of Christ, of the Apostles, and of some great saints (Adrian, Babylas, Christine, Christopher, Julian, Justus and Abondus, Theodosius, the Forty martyrs) rather than the Byzantine East.

---

<sup>62</sup> E. Lévi-Provençal, *La Péninsule Ibérique au Moyen-Age d'après le "Kitâb ar-Rawd al Mitâr fi Habar al-Aktâr" d'Ibn Abd al-Munim al-Himyari*, (Leyden, 1938), 182.

<sup>63</sup> Alfonso el Sabio, *Cantigas de Santa Maria* (Madrid, 1889), ii, 241-3: 'ua eigreï' antiga ... dentro na Arreixaca e 'yvan 'y orar genôses, pisaos et outros de Cezilla'.

<sup>64</sup> For example, the feasts of the martyrs of India, Thomas, of Persia, Simon and Jude, and of Ethiopia, Matthew; or even the African Cyprian made titular incumbent of the mythical bishopric of Tasia.

Constantinople does not even figure here, but only the great *martyria*, Cesarea of Cappadocia, Chalcedonia, Nicodemia, and Patras. Egypt is known only slightly because of the tomb of Mark and the feasts of the Copts, that of the Red Earth, Maghra, on 9 March, and the Nayrûz on 29 August, folkloristic rather than religious. Italy and Africa also feature: eleven feasts associated with Italy, of which seven are linked to Rome, and one each to Milan, Catania, and Nola. Five are linked to Africa: Marciana of Cesarea, Speratus of Carthage, Augustine, Cyprian, and Marcellus of Tanger.<sup>65</sup> Finally, Gaul is almost absent, with only two feasts, Martin of Tours and Colomba of Sens. Thus, all in all, the Mozarabic sanctoral, in the land of Islam, lays out the contours of a Christianity which retained a vast knowledge, yet completely stabilized by the first decades of the eighth century.

This theme is an important specific feature of the Mozarabic Church of Andalucia. There is a very marked difference between the sanctoral of the Calendar and that of the monasteries of the North of the peninsula, permeated as they were by Gallican influences from the eleventh century onwards.<sup>66</sup>

The identity of the Arabic Christians of the West is thus very clearly defined. The example of Qustas at Kairouan and the objurgations of Alvarus of Córdoba, show, in the totality of the geographical area under consideration, a linguistic Arabism opted for, and fully assumed, by the élite classes.<sup>67</sup> One must, of course, take into account the individuality of Sicilian Hellenism and its Ifriqiyyan

---

<sup>65</sup> P. Fernández Rodríguez, 'Testimonio de la comunión eclesial en la historia de la liturgia mozárabe', in *Liturgia y musica mozárabes*, (Toledo, 1978), 163-212, 199, insists, on the contrary, on the frequency of Mozarabic church dedications to African saints without, however, establishing either figures or percentages.

<sup>66</sup> Dom M. Férotin, *Le "Liber ordinum" en usage dans l'Eglise wisigothique et mozarabe d'Espagne du cinquième au onzième siècle* (Paris, 1904).

<sup>67</sup> D. Urvoy draws a significant parallel between eastern *shu'ûbiyya* and Mozarabism: the former affirms Islam *vis-à-vis* the Arabs, the latter affirms his Arabism *vis-à-vis* Islam.

variant. Linguistic Arabism was here moulded within the framework of the Byzantine rite and doubtlessly it permeated the liturgy more profoundly. In Africa, just as in Spain, the Latinity of the Church was however jealously protected, and Eastern theology did not encroach upon the great doctrinal options or the basic principles of ecclesiastical organization of the Visigothic and African Churches. Yet these were minor communities which regrouped themselves around their dogmas and their pride, in order to conserve simultaneously both the principle of religious identity and the memory of the Empire.

## THE SURVIVAL OF THE COMMUNITIES

### *1 Episcopal Continuity and Political Collaboration*

The persistence of the episcopal framework was a *sine qua non* for the survival of Arabized Christian communities. Without a bishop, there would be no holy oils for baptism, nor would there be ordained clergy. Episcopal continuity was equally necessary in order to ensure civil administration, the collection of taxes, the very process of justice, and the relations with the Muslim State, so much so that the authorities would intervene in order to ensure its presence.<sup>68</sup> But it became precarious if a certain minimal number of active bishops was not reached, and if the *placet* of the prince was not guaranteed. Mikel de Epalza remarks that it depended first on the presence of flourishing monasteries, concentrated in Baetica, and on a strong episcopal solidarity which alone could ensure consecration.<sup>69</sup> He specifically reinterprets the palace duties of bishops

---

<sup>68</sup> In 1076 the Sovereign of Tunis ('Abd al-Haqq b. Khurâsân) ordered that a bishop should be assigned to a community, definitely that of Tunis; he ordered the imprisonment and whipping of the Archbishop of Carthage, Cyriacus; Talbi, 'Le christianisme', 325.

<sup>69</sup> M. de Epalza and E.A. Llobregat, 'Hubo mozarabes en tierras valencianas?', *Revista de l'Institut de Estudios Alicantinos*, 36, 2 (1982), 7-32.

(embassies, translations, fiscality) as so many pledges given to the prince to ensure the granting of his *placet*.<sup>70</sup>

Intimacy with the sovereign – which one comes across even in the East – was come by through the placing of science, both astronomical and medical,<sup>71</sup> at his disposal. This precariousness first becomes evident in Spain. The lists of bishops given by Simonet are theoretical. In the synods of the ninth century, one does not find more than a dozen bishops in the thirty official bishoprics of Andalus;<sup>72</sup> and the tardy testimony regarding the presence of Mozarabic bishops at the time of the Reconquest has been called into question. The perspective of Spanish historiography tends towards the idea of a rapid and almost complete Islamization of Andalus, sparing only Baetica (Córdoba, Málaga,<sup>73</sup> Seville, and Guadix) and the frontier zones.<sup>74</sup> Ricard has already claimed that the *episcopus* of Lisbon, mentioned in 1147 in the chronicle of the Crusader Osbern, had really been a Christian bishop; he prefers to see in him a Muslim *qâdî*.<sup>75</sup> Yet Christopher Picard, on the contrary,

<sup>70</sup> M. de Epalza, 'La islamización de al-Andalus. Mozárabes y neomozárabes', *Revista de l'Institut Egipcio de estudios islámicos*, xxiii (1985-6), 171-9.

<sup>71</sup> The model here is Recemundo/Rabî b. Zayd, Bishop of Elvira, astronomer and medical doctor, ambassador in 955 to Germany, and author of *Calendrier de Cordoue*.

<sup>72</sup> The lists of the Synods held from 839 to 864 include, for Baetica, the prelates of Almería (Urci), Baza, Baeza, Cabra, Córdoba, Ecija, Elche, Elvira, Guadix, Málaga, Martos, and Medinasidonia, together with those of Merida and Toledo.

<sup>73</sup> Bishop Julian is attested to by Pascal II's bull of 1117; F. Fita, 'Obispos mozárabes refugiados en Toldeo a mediados del siglo XII', *Boletín de la R. Academia de la Historia*, 3 (1897), 529-32.

<sup>74</sup> Epalza, 'La islamización', grafts on this the sense of a massive immigration of Christians, military traders, slaves, singers, members of religious orders, in the eleventh century before the Reconquest, whom he calls neo-mozarabes; in Toledo, this immigration, according to J. Molénat, did actually take place, but *after* the Reconquest.

<sup>75</sup> He parleyed with the Crusaders, then he was killed after the attack; R.

insists on the continuity at Coimbra, Lisbon, Niebla, Ocsonoba, which became Shantamâriya (Santa Maria) al-Gharb and the centre of a great pilgrimage, and also at Santarem, Saltes, and Sintra. M. de Epalza concentrates his critique on the evidence of the Mozarabic presence in the Levant; the toponomy (obsolete place-names built on the Arabic *Kanisa* or *Kanisiyya*, meaning Church)<sup>76</sup> merely indicates the presence of the ancient nuclei of Arab Christians, which in Majorca may date from the Islamo-Byzantine condominium which ended at the beginning of the tenth century. Monachism is absent from Sharq al-Andalus,<sup>77</sup> and the remoteness from Toledo and Córdoba explains why – with the exception of two bishops, of Elche in 828 and Valencia in 1101 or 1104 – we do not possess any information about the bishoprics in the capitals (Denia, whose community was entrusted by the sovereign of *tayfa* in 1058 to the bishop of Barcelona) or the major towns (Elda and Jativa).

The collapse of the African episcopal structure is even more impressive. The lists of the seventh century contained more than 40 sees,<sup>78</sup> in 1053, as Leo IX attested, Africa had no more than

Ricard, 'Le prétendu évêque mozarabe de Lisbonne', *Revue du Moyen-Age Latin*, iii, 3 (1947), 245-54; id., 'Episcopus et cadi: l'évêque mozarabe de Lisbonne', *Revue du Moyen-Age Latin*, vii (1951), 111-22. Osbern informs us that Lisbon had as many as 9,000 families of tributaries. Chr. Picard, 'Les Mozarabes de l'Occident ibérique', *Revue des Etudes Islamiques*, li (1983), 77-88.

<sup>76</sup> As done by Sanchis Guarner, *Els parlars romanics*, Canassia, Canessia, Alcanissia, Ses Canessies, Conesa in the provinces of Valencia, Lérida, and Minorca, and also in Catalonia; Sanchis Guarner highlights too a certain number of toponyms built on the Ar. *Munastir*, which he interprets as an 'Almoravid convent'.

<sup>77</sup> Yet we know that Jacques I the Conqueror gave, in 1232, before the Conquest, the church of Saint-Vincent de la Roqueta in Valencia to the monastery of Saint-Victoriano: P. Guichard, *Les Musulmans de Valence*, ii, 400. This poses the problem of the status of these Mozarabic 'hermitages' brought to light by local erudition. M. de Epalza recalls that they might have lodged a group of monks coming from somewhere else, on the model of St Catherine in Sinai.

<sup>78</sup> R.P. Mesnage, *Le Christianisme en Afrique. Déclin et extinction*



five bishops, and one only in 1076,<sup>79</sup> whereas three were indispensable for episcopal consecration. The matter has been discussed in detail and clarified by Ch. Courtois.<sup>80</sup> In 1053 the bishop of Gumi claimed the primacy of Byzacène; the see was evidently that of the zîrid capital, Mahdiyya. In 1076 Servandus was anointed by Gregory VII Bishop of Bougie,<sup>81</sup> capital of Nâsir b. 'Alannâ, at the request of the prince. One should finally note that the community of the Qal'a of the B. Hammâd should not be counted among the bishoprics.<sup>82</sup>

A few indications of the existence of Christian communities dispersed in Africa, yet without testified bishops, also underline this fragility: at Sbeitla, up to the Hilalian invasion,<sup>83</sup> at Wargla in the tenth century, a group which first came from Madjdjâna to Tahert and allied to the Ibadite refugees after the downfall of the Rostemide Imamate,<sup>84</sup> communities dispersed in Nafzâwa were again recalled in the fourteenth century by Ibn Khaldûn,<sup>85</sup> and there are other

(Paris-Algiers, 1915), 180.

<sup>79</sup> 'Decus ecclesiarum Africanarum ita conculcatum a Gentibus nimium dolemus, ut modo vix quinque inveniantur episcopi ...', and 'Africam ad tantam episcoporum orbitatem devenisse, ut ne tres quidem qui episcopum consacrent inveniantur'.

<sup>80</sup> Courtois, 'Grégoire VII'.

<sup>81</sup> Mistaken by the Roman Court for Hippone.

<sup>82</sup> P. de Cénival, 'Le prétendu évêché de la Kala', *Hespéris*, xv (1932), 1-10.

<sup>83</sup> N. Duval, 'Observations sur l'urbanisme tardif de Sufetula', *Cahiers de Tunisie*, 45-6 (1964), 87-103, 103: the occupation of the church of Sts Gervasius, Protasius, and Tryphon.

<sup>84</sup> Lewicki, 'Une commune chrétienne', holds that they had a double function, military and commercial. The account of the presence of the Madjdjâna comes from Yâqût, who must have used Muhallabî as his source.

<sup>85</sup> *Histoire des Berbères et des dynasties musulmanes de l'Afrique septentrionale*, trans. Slane (Paris, 1969), i, 231: 'des Francs qui vivent sous la protection d'un traité; ... depuis la conquête musulmane ..., ils jouissent du libre exercice de leur religion et en paient la capitation'; and *ibid.*, iii, 156: 'des confédérés d'origine franque dont les ancêtres vinrent



indications not reliably dated (toponyms in Kanîsa of Djabal Nafûsa).<sup>86</sup>

Finally, in Sicily, only one episcopal see is reliably testified at the time of the Norman conquest – the Greek Archbishop Nicodemus, in Palermo, was then residing at the small church of St Cyriac, soon to be replaced by the Latin bishop. As to Bishop James, whom an extremely dubious document associates with the priory of the Fiumefreddo, close to Taormina, he probably did exist but his status is completely uncertain.

Thus one notices that the Muslim authorities wanted to maintain an episcopal hierarchy everywhere, even intervening rather clumsily in order to ensure its presence. In 1146, when the Almohads expelled to Toledo the Mozarabs, who had been installed forcibly by the Almoravids in Morocco, it was with their bishops and by a big number of ecclesiastics.<sup>87</sup> On its part, the episcopate used to guarantee the administrative organization and the respect of the fiscal regulations which assured the survival of the Christian group. Thus Hostegesis, Bishop of Málaga, denounced to the treasury the rural populations who risked, for want of paying the *djizya*, escaping from the jurisdiction of the Christians.<sup>88</sup>

We must be grateful to M. de Epalza for having thrown light on the central importance, as in the Muslim East, of the episcopal institution. At the same time one should not forget the presence of civil authorities, the count (*qûmis*) and the *exceptor* in Andalus, and the judge in Spain (*qâdî al-a'djam, al-nasârâ*) and in Tripolitania.<sup>89</sup> Like the bishops, they were close to the prince and

de Sardaigne'.

<sup>86</sup> R. Basset, 'Les sanctuaires du Djébel Néfousa', *Journal Asiatique*, xiii (1899), 423-70; xiv (1899), 88-120.

<sup>87</sup> *Cronica Adefonsi imperatoris*, ed. L. Sanchez Belda (Madrid, 1950), 162, 205: 'Quo tempore, multa milia militum et peditum christianorum cum suo episcopo et cum magna parte clericorum, qui fuerant de domo regis Ali et filii eius Texufini, transierunt mare et venerunt Toletum'.

<sup>88</sup> Epalza, 'Les Mozarabes'.

<sup>89</sup> At En Ngila, a tomb carries the epitaph of PETRUS KL[arissimus]IVDEX.

possibly belonged to the royal Visigothic nobility, like Count Abû Sa'îd and Hafs b. Albar.<sup>90</sup> Moreover, the presence at Kairouan of a *senior*, an institution particular to the African Church, very well documented in the fourth century and again on later inscriptions, demonstrates the complexity of the ecclesiastical administration and the role reserved in it for laymen. Similarly, the account of the *lector* at Kairouan presupposes a programme of studies and literary knowledge at least around the episcopal sees. The general effect is one which shows strong community structures embracing education and fiscal as well as judicial administration. They recall the late Roman town, suggesting a transmission which could have begun through tributary autonomy (for example, in the towns of north-eastern Sicily before the battle of Rametta and the great Fatimid enterprise of *incastellamento* which followed it).<sup>91</sup>

## 2 The Monastic Framework

Thus, in Andalus as well as in Sicily, the religious framework rested basically on the monasteries. The *Calendar of Córdoba* mentions as many as ten in the capital of the Spanish Caliphate and in the neighbouring countryside. These hosted the main celebrations of the feasts of the saints, including those of the martyrs of Andalus:<sup>92</sup> Armilat, Aulia, Catinas, Gerisset, Lanitus, Nubiras (or Anubaris), Pinamella, the White monastery of Jelinas, St Cyprian of Córdoba, and that of Sts Justus and Pastor, believed to be situated at Fraga. The *sierra de Córdoba*, in particular, seems to have been a sacred mountain. In the west of the peninsula, the

---

<sup>90</sup> Cagigas, *Minorias.*, 369.

<sup>91</sup> H. Bresc, 'Les Fatimides, les Croisés et l'habitat fortifié', in *Habitat fortifié et organisation de l'espace en Méditerranée médiévale* (Lyon, 1982), 29-34.

<sup>92</sup> Perfectus, Pelagius, Emila, Adolph, and John, as well as Alvarus and Speraindeo, who are not testified as martyrs.

monastery of Saint-Vincent on the Cape, rich in *ahbās* possessions in Algarve, represents religious power and cultural continuity.<sup>93</sup>

In Sicily, the documents of the Norman era recall at least four monasteries of Muslim times and of the Greek rite. The monks prayed for the victory of the Normans at the monastery of St Mary of Vicari, as witnessed by a Greek diploma, probably interpolated, of Count Roger.<sup>94</sup> St Angelo of Brolo, in Valdemone, would have been reconstructed in 1084, according to the ratification diploma of 1145. St Philip of Demenna, at Fragalà, was restored around the same date. Finally, St Philip of Argirò, in the borough of Agira, amply evidenced in the saints' lives, was attributed by the Normans to the Latin Church. Yet it must still have been extant since Henry Aristippe quotes, it seems to me, its library around 1158.<sup>95</sup> In the tenth century, this was the nursery where Christopher was formed, father of Sts Saba and Macaire, before he retired on Mount Etna at St Michael of Ktisma.

Besides the monastic establishments, the lives of Sicilian saints bear witness to the existence of dispersed churches, like that of St Aussenzio on the route of the Pass of San Nicone, above Taormina, where Elijah of Reggio, the Speleote, resided in the ninth century. The system of Anachorite hermits thus strongly links Sicilian monachism to its Greek models.

It was only in Africa – until recent archaeological finds in Tripolitania – that one could believe in the absence of monastic structures.<sup>96</sup> Yet the cemetery of En Ngila (between 945 and 1021) revealed the tombs of two abbots, the *aba Petrus mon[ac]u[s]*, who

<sup>93</sup> Picard, 'Les Mozarabes'.

<sup>94</sup> S.Cusa, *I Diplomi greci ed arabi di Sicilia*, i, 1-2 (Palermo, 1868-82), 4-6.

<sup>95</sup> Ch. H. Haskins and D.P. Lockwood, *The Sicilian Translators of the Twelfth Century and the First Latin Version of Ptolemy's Almagest* (Harvard, 1910), 169: to his friend Roboratus, *Habes in Sicilia Siracusanam et Argolicam bibliothecam*: 'argolica' cannot be taken to mean 'Greek'; it is a geographical precision, on the same plan as Syracuse.

<sup>96</sup> Thus Talbi, 'Le christianisme', 331: the toponymy (with the exception of *Monastir* of Byzacène) is poor in indications about the ancient *days*.

died during the tenth Indiction, and the *aba Laurentius monachus*, who died during the thirteenth Indiction.<sup>97</sup> Thus, in the final analysis, in the totality of the three Christian communities examined, the monastic structure was the basis, the training school, and the point of refuge, if need be, of the ecclesiastical hierarchy, which does not remove them too much, after all, from the Latin Europe of the tenth and eleventh centuries.

### 3 Resistance and Emigration

Numerous dangers threatened the established Arabized Christian communities after the time of the large-scale conversions. The intransigence shown in monastic milieux in Spain *vis-à-vis* the Muslim authorities – provocation by means of insults to the Prophet (*istikhfâf*), the apostasy (*irtidâd*) of the children of mixed marriages<sup>98</sup> – recalls similar crises in the Ottoman Balkans and fanatics soliciting martyrdom. This aggressive and suicidal resistance to religious assimilation left very deep marks. The Mozarabs spontaneously proclaimed Eulogius and his companions saints. Yet this resistance from 850 to 859 harvested only a small crop – 51 voluntary martyrdoms in all, concentrated at Córdoba, with admittedly a later outbreak in 890, 923 (Eugenia), 925 (Galician Pelagius), and again in 974 (Dominic *Saracenus*). The *Chronicle of Cambridge* records at least one echo of these events in Spain: in 906, after a persecution during Lent, a monk named Argentius was executed in Palermo.<sup>99</sup>

---

<sup>97</sup> G. Gualandi, 'La presenza cristiana nell'Ifriqiya: l'area cimiteriale di En Ngila (Tripoli)', *Felix Ravenna*, cv-cvi (1973), 257-79; C. Rizzardi, 'Nuova iscrizione rinvenuta nella necropoli tardo-antica di En Ngila (Tripoli)', in *Atti del III Congresso nazionale di Archeologia Cristiana* (Trieste, 1974), 519-24.

<sup>98</sup> Millet-Gérard, *Chrétiens mozarabes*, 31, Flora, in the village of Ausinianos, and Aurelius.

<sup>99</sup> M. Amari, *Storia dei Musulmani di Sicilia*, rev. edn. by G. Levi della Vida and C.A. Nallino (Catania, 1930-9), ii, 165, n. 3.

Nor were open rebellion and military support given to the operations of the Christian kingdoms against the Dâr al-Islâm completely absent. In 816-17, in keeping with a promise of aid by Louis the Good, the Christians of Mérida took up arms.<sup>100</sup> Later the Mozarabs supplied the Cid<sup>101</sup> with auxiliaries at Valencia, guided and doubtlessly fomented the great expedition of Alphonse I the Warrior, while the Christians of Sicily successfully welcomed the triumphal arrival first of George Maniakès and then that of Roger the Norman. There is no doubt, however, that the revolt of Ibn Hafsûn should not be attributed to Mozarabic irredentism: it was a rebellion of converts, the *Muwalladûn*, against ‘Abd al-Rahman I; and the conversion of Ibn Hafsûn to Christianity is not completely proven: it might be nothing more than an argument by the chroniclers to besmirch his moral image. Even more serious, mass emigration definitely affected successively the three Christian communities of Africa, Spain, and Sicily. First, it affected the monastic higher echelons and the clergy. Between 715 and 731, Gregory II warned the ecclesiastical authorities in Germania against the emigrants from Africa who set up heretical communities there.<sup>102</sup> From 868 onwards, Alphonse III led off some families from Coimbra.<sup>103</sup> The Mozarabic migration first led the Andalucian monks to Galicia and to León: in 869 Abbot Ofilón and his companions of Córdoba, who represented the monastery of Samos; in 872, those who founded Sahagùn in 910, Abbot Egila at San Esteban and San Martín,<sup>104</sup> in 913 and 921 the Abbots of Córdoba Alfonso and John at San Miguel de Escalada and at San Martín of Castaneda. The documents of San Cosma of León and of the monastery of Ardón, between the tenth and eleventh centuries, enable us to outline a

---

<sup>100</sup> Picard, ‘Les Mozarabes’.

<sup>101</sup> According to Ibn Idhârî, in 1090 the Cid had the gates guarded by the ‘Christians of the country’, *Rûm baladiyyûn*; V. Lagardère, ‘Communautés mozarabes et pouvoir almoravide’, *Studia islamica*, lxxvii (1988), 99-119.

<sup>102</sup> Talbi, ‘Le christianisme’, 316.

<sup>103</sup> Picard, ‘Les Mozarabes’.

<sup>104</sup> Díaz Jiménez, ‘Inmigración’.

geography of the immigration of Christians with Arabic names into Tierra de Campos, in the valley of Cea and Val de Raduey.<sup>105</sup> The calculations which Joaquín Pérez Fernández-Figares<sup>106</sup> has recently offered do not evidently possess any rigorous statistical support, but the deductions he draws from them appear quite plausible – some thousands of migrants.

The precariousness of their frontier position, the ease of emigration, and the powerful and rapid movement of converts in the early times of the conquest definitely contributed to form, from the Christian communities of the West, an administrative and military élite. The role which the Mozarabs played in Morocco as guards to the Almoravid princes illustrates the strong link which they had with the State. Tensions are certainly the same as those in the contemporary East, that of the Muslim and Jewish uprisings against the Churches of Cairo, Ascalon, and Jerusalem reported by Yahyâ of Antioch. In this sense, one hardly detects any difference from the Western Muslim world. Like Egypt and Syria, it feels the fear of a 'fifth column' which helps any project for an invasion. As in the East, the Christian ministers are the object of the vigilant hostility of other branches in the bureaucracy and in the army.

## THE IMPACT OF THE LATIN CONQUEST

### 1 *Inventory of Fixtures*

Emigration and the reduction of bishoprics are thus manifest in Sicily as well as in Africa; in both regions there remained but one bishopric at the moment when the threat of a Latin reconquest became a reality. In the Iberian peninsula, the disappearance of the bishoprics is obvious in Huesca,<sup>107</sup> and in Valencia from where

---

<sup>105</sup> W. Merino Rubio, 'Toponimia mozárabe en la repoblación nel territorio leonés', in *León medieval. Doce estudios* (Leon, 1978), 41-56.

<sup>106</sup> J. Pérez Fernández-Figares, 'Los Mozárabes en el Norte de España', *Cuadernos de Estudios medievales*, xii-xiii, (1984-85), 155-76.

<sup>107</sup> C. Laciencia and Ph. Senac, *Musulmans et Chrétiens dans le Haut Moyen Age: aux origines de la Reconquête Aragonaise* (Paris, 1991), 35; there is

Alphonse VI led off all the Christians in 1102 before setting the city on fire.<sup>108</sup> The disappearance of bishoprics occurred later in Baetica, where it followed the collaboration of the Mozarabs with the expedition of Alphonse I the Warrior, in 1125-26.<sup>109</sup> The Christians of Granada put at his disposal 12,000 warriors and he led out 10,000 families from Granada to Aragon. The others, on a *fatwa* of the Cadi Ibn Rushd, were shifted over to Morocco. Yet the expulsion was not complete; Christianity in Granada was still extant in 1129. There is evidence of a second deportation in 1138, while the Christians of Seville reached Meknès. In 1143 the Archbishop of Seville took refuge at Talavera de la Reina, and the bishops of Medinasidonia and Niebla, as well as the one who called himself John of Marchena, fell back on Toledo.<sup>110</sup>

Thus, paradoxically, the first effect of the Reconquest was to disperse the Mozarabs and increase their numbers and ascendancy over Africa. The authoritarian deportation placed the Christians at the service of the Almoravid State of Marrakech. Other groups settled down at Fez. Yet the enforced emigration of entire communities of Spanish Mozarabs to Morocco did not in fact bring about the amalgamation or the lasting revitalization of the African Church.<sup>111</sup> Traces of this are to be found in the colophon of the Gospel

evidence of bishops around 800, but in the eleventh century, there remained but one church, *San Pedro*, which kept its specific rite up to the thirteenth century, the toponym of 'neighbourhood of the Count', *hârat al-qûmis*, and some respected families with Arabic names (Maruán, Ybenzancalos, Ybenmenra).

<sup>108</sup> The bishop was thus a 'Frank', doubtlessly brought by the Cid - the Cistercian Jerome of Périgueux.

<sup>109</sup> Lagardère, 'Communautés mozarabes', presents an in-depth analysis of the expedition: its stages - Valencia, Alcira, Denia, Murcia, Baza, Guadix, Granada, Alcalà la Real, Ecija, Lucena, Aranzuel, Málaga - marking as many Mozarabic communities, whose presence is confirmed by other sources, and we cannot ignore his reasoning concerning Alcira, ex-bishopric, and Denia.

<sup>110</sup> Fita, 'Obispos mozárabes'.

<sup>111</sup> We should not give too much credence to the article by F. Arnoulet,



book, lost, copied at Fez by the Bishop Michael b. 'Abd al-'Aziz, and, in the manuscript at Kairouan,<sup>112</sup> which contains specifically a Gospel book, recopied in 1394 from a text which had itself been copied at Fez in 1195 by the Deacon Abû 'Umar John. After the retreat of the Almohads, there still remained some mercenaries, the *Furkhân*, settled close to the palace and engaged in the immediate defence of the dynasty.<sup>113</sup> One can quote the Arabic psalter (*Kitâb al-Zabûr*) written at Sabta/Ceuta in 1239 by Martin al-Furkhânî, servant of St Mary.<sup>114</sup> Yet the majority of the Mozarabs were expelled to Toledo, where their arrival permits, after 1150, the drawing up of a map of their places of origin within the *nisbas*: Córdoba, Pedroches, Seville, Osuna, Guadix, Andujar, Málaga, Baeza, Murcia, Lorca, Denia, the Algarve, and of course Marrakech.<sup>115</sup>

In Sicily, a look at the map of the places where Christians carried Arabic names or surnames in the lists of serfs and in the deeds of practice of the twelfth and the beginning of the thirteenth centuries permits the identification of numerous regions: Palermo in the first place, Corleone inland, Mazara in western Sicily, Girgenti in southern Sicily, both facing the African coast, then a group of boroughs and towns in the area of contact between the Val di Mazara in the West and the Valdemone, Collesano, Caccamo, Cefalù, Petralia, Messina, Aci, and finally Catania in eastern

---

'L'église mozarabe en Tunisie au XIIIe siècle', in *Actes du Ve Colloque international sur l'histoire et l'archéologie de l'Afrique du Nord. Afrique du Nord antique et médiévale. Spectacles, vie portuaire, religions. Avignon, avril 1990* (Paris, 1992), 249-54; it is based on the settling of Spanish Christians in Tunis by Yaqûb al-Mansûr without any supporting evidence.

<sup>112</sup> 120/829 in the Library of the Mosque of Sidi Uqba.

<sup>113</sup> P. de Cenival, 'L'Eglise chrétienne de Marrakech au XIIIe siècle', *Hespéris*, vii (1927), 79-84.

<sup>114</sup> Halima Ferhat, *Sabta des origines à 1306. Vie et mort d'une cité* (unpublished Ph.D. thesis, University of Paris I, 1990), 513.

<sup>115</sup> Molénat, 'Note sur les traducteurs'.

Sicily. Some Arabic names and surnames can again be found in the heart of Valdemone, at Fitalia, Frazzano, Librizzi, and Naso. The most important are the capital, the large towns, and the area of contact. In the absence of documentary evidence, we know near to nothing about Syracuse and Val de Noto. It is most probable, however, that other nuclei of Arabic Christianity had survived there, as they did in Catania.

In Calabria, where the Muslim domination was short-lived, the use of Arabic names can only be an indication either of the presence of some nuclei of immigrants from Sicily, or of cultural influence by proximity albeit very limited. Such names can be found not far from Reggio, at Scilla (1145), Aieta (near Paola, 1269), Nardò (1134), and Gerace (1100, 1157); also at Cerchiara (near Castrovillari, 1187, 1192), and Santa Severina (near Crotone, 1099); and finally even up to Basilicata, at Policoro (near Matera, 1131) and Acerenza (near Potenza, 1211). The significance of these names, however, should not be exaggerated. None the less, one should notice, according to Vera von Falkenhausen,<sup>116</sup> the presence of the name Hammûd among the serfs of Gerace, and, above all, among the aristocracy,<sup>117</sup> where it may possibly point to matrimonial alliances with the branch of the Sicilian Hammûdites converted to Christianity and the transfer of property. It is also a fact that in Calabria the presence of Christians of Sicilian origin carrying Arabic names can equally be encountered together with the presence of Syrian or Anatolian Arabs, like the Kharsianites, very often referred to.

---

<sup>116</sup> 'I gruppi etnici nel regno di Ruggero II e la loro partecipazione al potere', in *Società, potere e popolo nell'età di Ruggero II (Atti delle Terze giornate normanno-sveve, Bari, 23-25 maggio 1977)* (Bari, 1979), 133-56, 137. In this article, which is a mine of information, the concept of 'Arabic' is that of the Muslim polemist, joining 'Muslim' and 'of racial origin in Arabia'; evidently it is not that of the monk from Messina who describes himself as 'Arabos'.

<sup>117</sup> In 1163, at Luzzi, Messire Roger *Chamuti*, son of Messire Roger de Martorano signed a charter; A. Pratesi, *Carte latine di abbazie calabresi provenienti dell'Archivio Aldobrandini* (Vatican City, 1958), 56-8; he was evidently a Norman.

Finally, in Africa, it is the accounts of the conquest itself which inform us about the survival of at least one community, that of the capital, Mahdiyya, still possessing a Metropolitan and having close ties with Sicily. Here the Christian community was still quite numerous. Yet quite early it had begun withdrawing towards Sicily. In 1129, one of the Greek diplomas of Mazara, in a region of Christian Arabs, lists the 'old' Stephen of Carthage, also called the Tailor, Philip of Africa, that is, of Mahdiyya, and Christodoulos of the West, that is, of the Gharb.<sup>118</sup> In 1148, during the siege led by George of Antioch the notables took refuge in the houses of the Christians (*and al-nasârâ*) and in the churches (*kanâ'is*), while George of Antioch prepared a camp outside Mahdiyya and Zawîla in order to provide shelter for the Christians.<sup>119</sup>

## 2 The Reactions of the Arabic Christian Communities

The collaboration of the bishops and of the civil Mozarabic higher staff with the Muslim monarchy was a basic fact. This is accounted for by the desire to afford protection to the communities, but also by the emergence of authorities suspicious of both tribal solidarity and the influence of the *fuqahâ*.<sup>120</sup> The functionaries from the Jewish or Christian minorities did not pose any danger whatsoever to the centralized State; on the contrary, they ensured a guarantee of automatic loyalty, since their own fortune and those of their kin depended entirely on the goodwill of the sovereign. Doubtlessly, as in the East of the Melkites, the Christians, heirs of a long tradition of submission to the Byzantine Empire and the

<sup>118</sup> H. Grégoire, 'Diplômes de Mazara (Sicile)', in *Annuaire de l'Institut de Philologie et d'Histoire orientales de l'U.L.B.* (1932), 79-107, n. 3.

<sup>119</sup> Ibn al-Athîr, xxxv, ed. M. Amari, *Biblioteca arabo-sicula*, (Turin-Rome, 1880-81), i, 472.

<sup>120</sup> This is particularly the case of the Aghlabid Ibrâhîm II, accused of madness and cruelty, and to whom the Greek hagiographic accounts attribute the killing of four Sicilians: John and Andrew, and the latter's two sons, Peter, treasurer of the emir, and Anthony, his tax-collector. M. Amari, *Storia dei Musulmani di Sicilia* (Florence, 1854-68), i, 515. He actually had the Christian Sawâda executed: *ibid.*, ii, 56.

Visigothic monarchy, tinged their loyalty with an ideological element – veneration towards the State in the abstract. Thus we encounter the presence of Christian tax-collectors,<sup>121</sup> masters of the mint,<sup>122</sup> and even vizirs, in Andalus as much as in Aghlabid and Zîrid Africa.<sup>123</sup> To the loyalty of the Christians and to their proverbial financial abilities, one must also add, as in the East, the little propensity which the Muslims had for money, and their refusal of jobs which entailed the handling of money or which had to do with blood.

This loyalty and service should not delude us. The Mozarabs of the West considered themselves as the legitimate heirs of the Roman Empire, and their collaboration with the Muslim State could not but peter out in view of the coming restoration. The enthusiasm of the Christians of Valdemone for Maniace shows their devotion to the Byzantine State; their collaboration with Roger I and their immediate disappointment confirm this eschatological expectation. In Spain, from 1089, they collaborated at Aledo with the Castilians.<sup>124</sup> This was a clear indication. The decisive fact of the Reconquest has been recognized in the Mozarabs' eagerness for the re-establishment of the monarchy of Toledo.<sup>125</sup> Sisnando Davídiz, a Mozarab from the north of Portugal, vizir of Mu'tadid of Seville, who passed into the service of Alphonse VI of Castile, clearly laid out the programme for this re-establishment to the Ziride of Granada 'Abdallâh,<sup>126</sup> and took part in its enactment –

---

<sup>121</sup> In Omeyyad Córdoba, Isaac was *exceptor rei publice*, before entering the monastery of Tabanos.

<sup>122</sup> At Kairouan under the Aghlabides.

<sup>123</sup> Sisnando Davidiz, Portuguese Mozarab, captured by Mu'tadid, was thus made his vizir. At Granada, it was Abû'l-Rabî that served the Zirid Bâdis. In Mahdiyya, it was George of Antioch who managed the finances of Zirid Tamîm.

<sup>124</sup> E. García Gómez, *El Siglo XI en primera persona* (Madrid, 1980), 206.

<sup>125</sup> V. Cantarino, *Entre monjes y musulmanes* (Madrid, 1978).

<sup>126</sup> García Gomez, *El Siglo XI*, 158.

the conquest of Coimbra<sup>127</sup> and the government of Toledo. *Inbiratur dhul-millatayn*, without doubt 'emperor of the two religions', but well-graded, Alphonse VI re-established, like the Byzantines of Aleppo, the lawful domination of Christian Arabs over the Muslims at the heart of the State.

Following the conquest by the Latin kingdom, the return to the fold of the Christian State did not entail either the loss of the dual specific nature of the Arabic Christians, or the abandoning of the religious rite, or the loss of Arabism and fusion with the Roman world. This was, however, the programme of the Gregorian Church which was prematurely applied in the north of Spain. In 1080, the Synod of Burgos brought to an end the 'superstition of the Toledan error', that is the Visigothic rite.<sup>128</sup> The best known and best analysed case of liturgical and religious resistance is that of Toledo. Far from being a minority on the way to disappearance and gradual extinction,<sup>129</sup> the Mozarabs here vigorously affirmed their language, even imposing it, between 1150 and 1200, over immigrants coming from the North, Castilians, and 'Francos'. As we have seen, for F.J. Fernández the use of Arabic in the Court documents paradoxically reinforces the declared continuity with the Romano-Visigothic past, and their particular laws, the *Fuero Juzgo*, became the laws of the city.

As in Toledo, the Arabic Christians of Palermo seemed to have attracted to their community some of the Latin immigrants,<sup>130</sup>

---

<sup>127</sup> Supported by the nearby Mozarabic monastery of Lorbão, which revictualled the besiegers.

<sup>128</sup> Cagigas, *Minorías*, 439.

<sup>129</sup> R. Pastor de Togneri, 'Problèmes d'assimilation d'une minorité: les Mozarabes de Tolède (de 1085 à la fin du XIIIe siècle)', *Annales E.S.C.* (1970), 351-90: the events cited here are partly untrue, like for example the option of the Mozarabs to accompany the Muslims into exile.

<sup>130</sup> Thus Nicolas Zikri, son of a Lombard, married to Sittelkioul, daughter of the qá'id Saûd.

some Franks,<sup>131</sup> and possibly even some converted Muslims.<sup>132</sup> The Arabic and Greek deeds which record the appearance before a notary of Arabic Christians in Sicily had to do basically with Palermo in the twelfth century. The signatory and the witnesses belonged to families we know and who gravitated around the Palatine Chapel, the Monastery of St Mary of the Grotto, and the Church of St Mary of Admiral George, that is George of Antioch (nowadays mistakenly called the Martorana). These were palace functionaries.

Two centuries later, however, the Arabic specificity petered out and changed into a remote pride of lineage. In Palermo and in Messina, the years 1280-1300 witnessed the last translations of Arabic diplomas in Latin by Christian notaries.<sup>133</sup> The slow de-Arabization of the Spanish Mozarabs is the basic theme of an unpublished thesis by Jean-Pierre Molénat; this process of de-Arabization is again found at Coimbra where certain canons in the edition of Synod decisions translated into Arabic are completely vocalized, then retranslated into Latin in the margins – an indication that the Mozarabs of Toledo were in the twelfth century gradually losing the use of their language of culture.<sup>134</sup>

Africa again marks the point of failure of the general programme of reconquest over Islam. The reconstruction of an African

<sup>131</sup> As evidenced by the tomb inscriptions of St Michael of the Andalucians, of Dreu, Norman nobleman and of his wife Anna; tomb inscriptions made by their son Grizant (Chrysante), a royal cleric. M. Amari, *Le Epigrafi arabiche della Sicilia*, Part ii, *Iscrizioni sepolcrali* (Palermo, 1879).

<sup>132</sup> 'Neo-Mozarabs', according to M. de Epalza; this would be the case of Obberto Fallamonaca, son of the qâ'id 'Abd al-Rahmân, last Arab of the Palace of Palermo, 'secreto' de Frederick II and benefactor of the Grotto, unless one must see in him a Christian of ancient lineage, as may be suggested by the first name of his grandfather, Filaymân. But then why take the personal name and the lineage name of a person from Genoa?

<sup>133</sup> Cf. H. Bresc, 'La propriété foncière des Musulmans dans la Sicile du XIIe siècle: trois documents inédits': paper read at the Conference of the Fondazione Leone Caetani, *Del nuovo sulla Sicilia musulmana* (3 May 1993), forthcoming.

<sup>134</sup> M.-Th. Urvoy, 'Notes de philologie mozarabe', *Arabica*, 36 (1989), 235-6.

Church was one of the outcomes, and indeed one of the aims, of the conquest of Mahdiyya. The inventory of the church of *Africa*, preserved in the archives of the Palatine Chapel in Palermo and the archbishop's tomb describe its political and religious scheme. Archbishop Costas, who died in Palermo on 10 September 1160 and was buried in the Cathedral,<sup>135</sup> carried a Greek name and had African origins. The continuator of Sigebert of Gembloux<sup>136</sup> actually confirms that, having come to Rome *sub servitute* to be consecrated bishop there, he returned free to his bishopric. The inventory suggests that he brought back relics of Regulus, who was the 'father of Africa' and of Sennen, an Eastern saint; these holy bodies were actually preserved in Rome and were perfectly suitable to preside over this refoundation. The liturgical furnishings – crosses, chalices, chasubles, ecclesiastical vestments, rings, mitres – were all made in Palermo on the bishop's orders.<sup>137</sup> Robert de Thorigny, in the Chronicle of Mont-Saint-Michel, gives the date of 1157 for the re-establishment of an archbishopric at *Sibilla* and the repopulation of this metropolis 'capital of the island of Djerba', 'between Mahdiyya and Cairo' by Christian inhabitants.<sup>138</sup> It seems that this is nothing more than a double of the refoundation of the archbishopric of Mahdiyya.<sup>139</sup>

---

<sup>135</sup> A. Casano, *Del sotteraneo della Chiesa cattedrale di Palermo* (Palermo, 1849), 56-8.

<sup>136</sup> *Monumenta Germaniæ Historica, Scriptores*, vi, 453-4: Roger, 'captaque insigni civitate quæ dicitur Affrica, Suilla [Zawîla], Asfax [Sfax], Clipea [Iqlibiyya], aliisque castris pluribus, archiepiscopum Affricæ, qui sub servitute Romam venerat consecrandus, ad sedem suam remittit liberum'.

<sup>137</sup> Garofalo, *Tabularium*, 34: 'dominus archiepiscopus fecit'.

<sup>138</sup> *MGH, SS*, vi, 473: 'Sibillam, civitatem metropolim, sitam inter Africam et Babilonem. Est autem eadem civitas caput regni insule Gerp, in qua rex habitatores christianos inmisit, et eis archiepiscopum prefecit'.

<sup>139</sup> Djerba was actually conquered as early as 1134-5/528 AH. The accounts of Robert de Thorigny are inaccurate and mythical; for the year 1180, he reports the alleged restitution of Mahdiyya and *Sibilia* to William II by the 'king of Morocco'; *ibid.*, 528.



The Almohad conquest delivered the death-blow to this Church of Africa. It was not the result of a policy of voluntary Islami-zation, of which Mohammed Talbi questions both the plan and the interpretation by historians, and which, in Ifriqiyya, is testified only for Tunis,<sup>140</sup> but the expulsion of a possible and probable 'fifth column' which would have collaborated with the Romance invader.<sup>141</sup> Numerous testimonies seem to agree about the presence of Christians at Ceuta, where Ibn 'Azafi set up the *Mawlid* of the Prophet in answer to the *Milâd* of Jesus; in Nefzawa again in the fourteenth century,<sup>142</sup> and the Jewish communities did not durably suffer. It was only around 1230 that they launched a wave of migration, particularly towards Sicily. The fact was that the Almohads, lacking a real policy, caught between Messianic proselytizing and State prudence, certainly expelled only those communities which were politically hostile. New names of Christians from Mahdiyya appeared in Sicilian documents after the fall of the 'African kingdom' of Roger II.<sup>143</sup> We can draw a parallel with the expulsion from Morocco to Toledo of Spanish Mozarabic communities installed there by the Almoravids after they had assisted in the expedition of Alphonse I the Warrior.

#### CULTURE AND LAW: AT THE ORIGINS OF THE STATE

The Arabic Christians provided the victorious State with numerous high officials. These included, in the first place, all political leaders, Sisnando Davídiz and George of Antioch, who were totally dedicated to the construction and expansion of the Castilian and Sicilian States. Even before the arrival of George, one is tempted

---

<sup>140</sup> Ibn al-Athîr, trans. Amari, *Biblioteca*, i, 487; conversion or death for the Jews and the Christians (information drawn from Ibn Shaddâd).

<sup>141</sup> As suggested by Dufourcq, 'La coexistence', 215.

<sup>142</sup> Brunschvig, *La Berbérie orientale*, 430, who quotes Tidjâni, Ibn al-Athîr, and Ibn Khaldûn.

<sup>143</sup> Johannes Afer signed in Latin in 1191: Cusa, *Diplomi*, 85. The priest Johannes Africanus in a 1266 transcription of a Greek deed in 6683/1175.

to identify already as Arabic some of the emirs of Roger I and of Adelaide, the notary Eugenius of Troina, and Christodule, whom Arabic chroniclers called 'Abdullâh al-Nisrânî or 'Abd al-Rahmân, and even 'Abd al-Rahmân b. 'Abd al-Azîz. L.R. Ménager solved the controversy: they were Greeks, the first one protector of St Philip of Fragalà, the second one founder of Patir in Rossano and of the Grotta of Marsala.<sup>144</sup> The uncertainty of the Arabic name of the second is a more powerful argument, but we know that a double name cannot be excluded.

The arrival of George of Antioch gave a particularly Melkite tinge to the authority in Sicily. Trained in Syria, before 1099, entrusted with the finances of Tamîm in Mahdiyya, he escaped with his companions in 1107 on a Sicilian ship and, as *Sâhib al-asghâl*, entered the service of Christodule who employed his companions in levying public funds, from 1123 onwards, Tidjânî reported that Christodule and George attempted the conquest of Mahdiyya. His function in the Muslim milieu at Iato, then his plan for the construction of an Arabic kingdom in Africa and of a powerful thalassocracy, eliminating Amalfî, then Pisa, give an idea of the extent of his abilities and his political training. On his death in 1151, the period of this collaboration came to an end, and the concluding years of Roger II's reign witnessed the rise of other forces and other skills.

The biggest project of George, as of Sisnando, consisted of the foundation of 'Arabic kingdoms',<sup>145</sup> administered by the Christian vizirs and emirs. The aim was to encircle from afar a Muslim

---

<sup>144</sup> L.-R. Ménager, *'Amiratus-amèras', L'Emirat et les origines de l'Amirauté (XIe-XIIIe siècles)* (Paris, 1960), 28 et seq.

<sup>145</sup> J. Johns, *'Malik Ifriqiya: The Norman Kingdom of Africa and the Fatimids', Libyan Studies*, xviii (1987), 89-101: the analysis of the role of Grizant (Chrysanthe) through his title of 'clerc royal', 'à la fois [parallelus] grec et latin' is particularly interesting. J. Johns sees in him the promoter of a policy of fusion and unification in one sole people of the different divisions of the Sicilian population, that is the plan which E. Jamison attributed to the emir Eugenius. One must remember that Grizant is of Norman lineage and that the family tombs are in the church of St Michael of the Andalucians.

population forming by far the majority in Africa, reversing on it the pressure of the *dhimma*.<sup>146</sup> The severity of the Christians of Sfax towards the Muslim population, theoretically governed by means of autonomous institutions (the 'Indirect Rule' of J. Johns), might have been the sign of a thirst for revenge and of the increased intransigence of local forces which were not part of George's plans. The striking of coinage with Arabic Christian inscriptions was itself an indication of the will to establish this State. Thus it happened in Toledo under Alphonse VIII (1158-1214) once again, which reveals the power of the Mozarabic political milieu.<sup>147</sup> The Sicilian coins and those which were struck in Mahdiyya in the name of Roger II and William I were meant for a Muslim majority; thus they did not carry the same signs of triumph which were reserved for the *titulatures* of the Chancellery.

Vizirs and emirs at the beginning of the conquest, the Arabic Christians also formed the 'nursery' for minor officials. In Toledo, these were the families of 'notarios del arabigo' (*Kâtib al-'arabî*), the Wâdiyashî, the B. 'Abd al-Malik, root of the house of the Counts of Orgaz, the B. Servando.<sup>148</sup> It was from among them that some of the Toledan translators of Alphonse X were recruited, Garcé Pérez and Fernando of Toledo. One must note the high status of their language among the authorities: Peter I, King of Aragon, in most cases signed the diplomas in Arabic.<sup>149</sup>

---

<sup>146</sup> We may accept on this point M. Brett's analysis in his 'Muslim Justice under Infidel Rule. The Normans in Ifriqiya 517-555 H/ 1123-1160 AD', *Cahiers de Tunisie*, xliii, 155-6 (1991): *Actes du Ve Congrès d'Histoire et de Civilisation du Maghreb (octobre 1989): Le Maghreb et les pays de la Méditerranée: échanges et contacts*, 325-368. There is one reservation, however; he takes for 'Sicilians' the Christians of Mahdiyya, and 'immigrants' ('settlers from Sicily') those of Sfax. Yet the replacement in 1151 of George on his death by a *ghulâm*, the eunuch Philip of Mahdiyya, implies, however, if not a change of the African realm, at least a certain uncertainty about its future.

<sup>147</sup> H.E. Kassis, 'Roots of Conflicts: Aspects of Christian-Muslim Confrontation in Eleventh-Century Spain', in *Conversion and Continuity*, 151-60.

<sup>148</sup> Molénat, 'Note sur les traducteurs'.

<sup>149</sup> Thus in 1101 a charter of Pons, bishop of Barbastro, in favour of

In Palermo the notarial milieu from which were recruited the Palatine functionaries was at the same time Arabic and Greek. Emir Eugenius showed a dual linguistic training, and the origin of his family (Troina) places him at the point of contact between Arabism and Hellenism. The other Eugene, who is also called *Abû 'l-Tayb* (equivalent to Eugenius) belongs to the Cali family (*toû Kaloû*), which yields, side by side with Greek names (Scholarios, Photios, Christodoulos, Theodoros) a certain number of Arabic names, Abolimule and Maymon.

At that time there was definitely no lack of contacts between the political and religious élites of Sicily and Spain. The Cathedral Chapter of Palermo and the palace milieu honoured at least one family of Spanish Mozarabs. From 1159 onwards, Julian the Andalucian (*Julianus Indulzius*) owned a house in the neighbourhood of the royal palace.<sup>150</sup> In 1181 John of Spain was a canon.<sup>151</sup> In 1185 'Abd al-Azîz, son of John Endoulsi, and his wife Christodoulè joined the milieu of Christian Arabs in Palermo.<sup>152</sup> They all belonged to the family of 'Andalucians', Indulci, who founded the private chapel of St Michael of the Andalucians.

José Mattoso observes that in the Iberian peninsula Roman Law had not been forgotten. There still remained, in the towns of the centre and of the south, the law of the Mozarabic communities, subjected to Islam and united around their clergy, who thus preserved the juridical tradition and knowledge impregnated by Roman law and supported by written texts. The *lex romana Wisigothorum*, the future *Fuero Juzgo*, was particularly the object of outstanding respect, like other canonical and liturgical books.

---

Saint-Victor: *Bitrû ibn Shândjuh; Cartulaire de l'abbaye de Saint-Victor de Marseille*, ed. M. Guérard, i (Paris, 1857), 450-1.

<sup>150</sup> Amico, *I Diplomi*, 20

<sup>151</sup> C.A. Garufi, *Documenti inediti dell'epoca normanna in Sicilia* (Palermo, 1899), 173. Jean *Indulcinus* is still canon in 1230; L. Garofalo, *Tabularium regiæ et imperialis Cappellæ collegiatæ divi Petri in regio panormitano Palatio* (Palermo, 1835), 60.

<sup>152</sup> Cusa, *Diplomi*, 669; their witnesses are Samiyûn b. Abî Lfûn, Philip son of Iôsiph, and Djûân b. 'Abd al-Malik.

Proof of this is the evidence of the great care taken for their preservation. The first two Kings of Portugal, Alfonso Henry (1128-85) and Sancho I (1185-1210), established close links with the ecclesiastics nourished in the Mozarabic culture, coming particularly from the Chapters of regular canons of Coimbra and Lisbon. José Mattoso suggests that these contacts contributed to create a favourable climate for the flourishing of the notions of sovereignty and civil law and their practice, the Portuguese monarchy remaining for yet another century, above all, military and feudal.<sup>153</sup> Twenty years before the Sicilian *Liber Augustalis*, the general laws of Alphonse II were the first expression of a 'juricentric' royalty.

In Toledo from 1101, then at Córdoba in 1241, the Mozarabs manifested the individuality of their law, the *Forum judicum*,<sup>154</sup> which was destined to become the common custom of the inhabitants of the ancient Visigothic capital. We must note, however, that apart from imperial Roman law of Greek or Latin expression, there must have been a corpus of Arabic texts. Thus Brett underlines the fact that in the account of the voyage of Ibn Djubayr, the Muslim jurisconsult Ibn Zur'a, a convert to Christianity, could judge the Christians according to the canons of their law (*qawanin shari 'atihim*).<sup>155</sup> How could he do this if these texts had not been translated into Arabic like the Synod canons of al-Andalus?

Vincente Contarino taxed the Arabic Christians with 'historical irrelevance', and Glick saw in them a helpless and disorientated community. The actual *doxa*, in the research about Iberian minorities, is to emphasize the periods of crisis, the complex of the *dhimmi*, to see them at the same time from the point of view of the oppressive and victorious majorities (Epalza) and from the point of view of permanent exile and extreme dependence. Comparative

---

<sup>153</sup> J. Mattoso, 'Les origines de l'Etat portugais (XIIe-XIVe S.)', in *Genèse de l'Etat moderne en Méditerranée, Approches historiques et anthropologiques des pratiques et des représentations* (Ecole française de Rome, 1993); id., *Identificação de um país. Ensaio sobre as origens de Portugal (1096-1325)* (Lisbon, 1985).

<sup>154</sup> Colbert, *Martyrs*, 31.

<sup>155</sup> Brett, 'Muslim Justice', 31.

research shows, I believe, that the Mozarabs and the other Arab-speaking Christians did not undergo their history passively, nor did they in any way abandon either of the two characteristics which define them.

The loss of the literature of the Mozarabs<sup>156</sup> and their more modest participation than that of the Jews in the Toledan translations contributed to popularize the negative judgement made by the Orientalists. This definitely helped to underestimate the fact that Mozarabic thought was essentially inclined to theology and history. The 'Mozarabic text of universal history', recovered at Kairouan and studied by Giorgio Levi della Vida,<sup>157</sup> takes up Orose, but it is also inspired by the Muslim chronicles of the Omeyyad Andalus. Two translations of Orose have seen the light of day, according to the study of Giorgio Levi della Vida, of which one was circulated in the Jewish milieu of Granada.<sup>158</sup>

To conclude, I would like to emphasise those characteristics which bring out the similarities as well as the differences between the Arabic Christians of the West and the other large minority – that of the Jews living in the three geographical areas under consideration – as well as the other groups which were defined in the world of Islam by a large measure of jurisdictional autonomy. It seems to me that these are the basic traits which identify the Christian in the West, particularly the Mozarab: service to the State, consideration of history, and deepening of theology. Service to the State certainly brings them close to the Jews in Spain, engaged in their turn from Zirid Granada in a long-lasting collaboration with the Muslim State, subsequently with the State after the Reconquest. This relation with the State brings them

---

<sup>156</sup> There remains, however, the poetic adaptation of the Psalms by Hafs b. Albar.

<sup>157</sup> 'Un texte mozarabe d'histoire universelle', *Etudes d'orientalisme dédiées à la mémoire de Lévi-Provençal*, i (Paris, 1962), 175-83.

<sup>158</sup> On Mozarabic Orose, G. Levi della Vida, 'La traduzione araba delle Storie di Orosio', *Al-Andalus*, xix (1954), 257-93; and id., *L'Occidente e l'Islam nell'Alto Medio Evo (XII Settimana of Spoleto, 1964)*, (Spoleto, 1965), 667-95, 687.

above all close to the Melkites of Egypt and Syria, as does their common interest in history, spontaneous and embedded in them, without ideological ties or dynastic programme. The weakness of the philosophical and scientific dimension, after the emigration of Constantine the African, distinguishes them, on the other hand, from the Nestorians and the Jews. In monastic life everywhere, there were closer similarities with the Melkites than with the Copts.

This profound support for the Reconquest was not merely the sign of a thirst for revenge. They actually reflected a vocation to act as leaders of foreign dynasties, to guide their politics and administration, definitely to Arabize them. They naturally formed a State élite, and the core of the new kingdoms, that is, of the Christian Arabic kingdoms, not only in Africa but also in the Iberian peninsula and Sicily. The failure does not consist only of their cultural submission, slow or rapid, to the Romance tongue and of the oblivion of their Arabism, though jealously preserved in Toledo, the Imperial capital. The failure consists of the prevalence of forms of government less centralized than those which they had suggested to the new princes, veritable 'Christian Sultans', and of the decay of the hierarchical order which ensured the stability and the simultaneous triumph of both the religion and the Empire. Africa, in expelling the Christians, and Sicily, in forcing out and deporting its Muslims, marked the first signs of failure of grandiose and realistic ambitions.